CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Application Date: August 5, 2015

Applicant: Florentino Perez for Elizabeth Mathis, owner

Property: 612 Arlington Street, Lot 15, Block 280, Houston Heights Subdivision. The property includes a historic 1,732 square foot one story residence and detached garage situated on a 6,600 square foot (50' x 133') interior lot.

Significance: Contributing Queen Anne style residence, constructed circa 1920, located in the Houston Heights Historic District South.

Proposal: Alteration – Replace existing original wood siding with cementitious siding on the residence and garage.

- Existing siding consists of approximately 80% 6" beveled lap siding and 20% 105 siding.
- Proposed siding will measure 6.25" wide and will feature a smooth finish.
- The existing residence is clad in vinyl siding and cementitious faux stone mounted over the original siding. The applicant has removed sections of the vinyl siding to allow staff to assess the condition of the original siding.
- The applicant has asserted that the existing siding is damaged beyond reasonable repair. The City's Structural Inspector visited the site and found the siding to be in good condition and not damaged to justify wholesale replacement.

See enclosed application materials and detailed project description on p. 4-7 for further details.

Public Comment: One opposed. See Attachment A.

Civic Association: No comment received.

Recommendation: **Denial - does not satisfy criteria**

HAHC Action: **-**

DRAFT

APPROVAL CRITERIA

ALTERATIONS, REHABILITATIONS, RESTORATIONS AND ADDITIONS

Sec. 33-241(a): HAHC shall issue a certificate of appropriateness for the alteration, rehabilitation, restoration or addition of an exterior feature of (i) any landmark or protected landmark, (ii) any building, structure or object that is contributing to an historic district, or (iii) any building, structure or object that is part of an archaeological site, upon finding that the application satisfies the following criteria, as applicable:

S - satisfies D - does not satisfy NA - not applicable

S	D	NA		
☐	☒	☐	(1)	The proposed activity must retain and preserve the historical character of the property; *Replacing undamaged historic wood beveled lap siding undermines the historical character of the property. The smooth finish cementitious replacement siding will have a different texture and profile, resulting in an altered appearance of the structure.*
☐	☐	☐	(2)	The proposed activity must contribute to the continued availability of the property for a contemporary use;
☐	☐	☐	(3)	The proposed activity must recognize the building, structure, object or site as a product of its own time and avoid alterations that seek to create an earlier or later appearance;
☐	☒	☐	(4)	The proposed activity must preserve the distinguishing qualities or character of the building, structure, object or site and its environment; *Historic wood beveled lap siding is a distinguishing quality of this building and of the Houston Heights Historic District South. This material often consists of old growth cypress or longleaf pine, which is no longer readily available. Removing undamaged historic siding represents a failure to preserve this distinguishing quality of the residence and the Historic District.*
☐	☐	☐	(5)	The proposed activity must maintain or replicate distinctive stylistic exterior features or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize the building, structure, object or site;
☐	☐	☐	(6)	New materials to be used for any exterior feature excluding what is visible from public alleys must be visually compatible with, but not necessarily the same as, the materials being replaced in form, design, texture, dimension and scale;
☐	☐	☐	(7)	The proposed replacement of missing exterior features, if any, should be based on an accurate duplication of features, substantiated by available historical, physical or pictorial evidence, where that evidence is available, rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other structures;
☐	☐	☐	(8)	Proposed additions or alterations must be done in a manner that, if removed in the future, would leave unimpaired the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object or site;
☐	☒	☐	(9)	The proposed design for any exterior alterations or addition must not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural material and must be compatible with the size, scale, material and character of the property and the area in which it is located; *Replacing undamaged historic wood siding with smooth finish cementitious siding results in the destruction of a significant portion of historical and architectural material.*
☐	☐	☐	(10)	The setback of any proposed construction or alteration must be compatible with existing setbacks along the blockface and facing blockface(s);
☐	☐	☐	(11)	The proposed activity will comply with any applicable deed restrictions.

DRAFT

N

PROPERTY LOCATION

HOUSTON HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT SOUTH

Building Classification
- Contributing
- Non-Contributing
- Park

INVENTORY PHOTO

EXISTING SIDING

EXISTING SIDING

PROJECT DETAILS

Exterior Materials: The applicant proposes to replace all of the existing siding with smooth finish 6 ¼ inch wide horizontal lap cementitious siding. The applicant has asserted that the historic wood siding has been damaged beyond repair due to termites and water infiltration. The existing structure is currently clad in vinyl siding and cementitious faux stone foundation skirting mounted over historic wood 6" wide beveled lap siding.

The applicant has removed sections of the vinyl siding along the south side of the house to allow staff to inspect the condition of the historic siding underneath. Staff visited the site on August 18th with a Structural Inspector and determined that the existing siding is not damaged. There were no visible indications that the existing wood siding was damaged beyond repair.

DRAFT

ATTACHMENT A

PUBLIC COMMENT
KENT MARSH

612 Arlington Street – Alteration-Siding

I OBJECT to the granting of a revised Certificate of Appropriateness for this project that will allow damaged wood siding to be replaced with smooth finish hardi board. I do not object to the removal of the existing vinyl siding but the areas of wood damage should be replaced with in-kind wood siding to restore the structure exterior similar to its original condition. Hardi-board should not be used as a replacement for damaged wood on existing historic contributing structures.

DRAFT